

Supplementary Submission to West Gate Tunnel Project Inquiry and Advisory Committee

In conjunction with Kororoit Institute Presentation by Tony Smith, 13 September 2017, cross referenced here by page numbers in print version of presentation

Introduction

Picture page 1 upper: View from newly opened West Gate Distributor shared user path bridge of reach of Maribyrnong River slated for main bridge and Mackenzie Road ramps, an illustration of which serves as the main cover image for the project proponents.

We note that neither Friends of Maribyrnong Valley nor Maribyrnong River Cruises have made formal submissions to this inquiry but that they and we very much endorse the thrust of David Barnes's expert evidence with respect to the regional importance of the riverfront south of Shepherds Bridge. Note that we also seek resolution of one issue we cannot find mention of in the EES:

What is the navigational clearance below the proposed Mackenzie Road ramps?

Acknowledgement of country

*the land was invaded
and people who weren't here were killed*

—Myron Lysenko, Woodend Poet, 1 August 2016

Picture page 1 lower: Melbourne, Rally for Elijah, 28 July 2017

Note that banners from the Rally were exhibited by Warriors of the Aboriginal Resistance- (WAR) in the Roslyn Smorgon Gallery outside the Performance Space cum Hearing Room through the first fortnight of this hearing.

Contents (top level)

Resequencing the headlines in our original submission so as to better contextualise and update key points while presenting our argument in the time allotted:

- Why we care
- The Rest of the World
- Transurban has to go
- A Fundamental Alternative
- Wrong Way Go Back

Note that our original submission had more of a stream of consciousness sequencing. It will be cross referenced in places to reduce redundancy.

Picture page 2 upper: Iconic Black Swans and Pelicans off the mouth of Kororoit Creek

Note that Pelicans are traditionally, if unfairly, associated with greed while Black Swans are with unpredictable surprise central to the notion of Emergence in Complex Systems, and departing container ships may be what WGTP is really about.

Why we care (section contents)

- Hosted by UniMelb Infrastructure Engineering
- Complex Systems and Knowledge Management
- Transport, Hydrology, Western Growth Areas
- Climate Change: obfuscation by vested interests
- Nepean Bay Bar: save Melbourne from rising sea

Picture page 2 lower: Upper Stony Creek storm water diversion under railway into Kororoit

Page 3 covers numbered points 1 and 3:

1. Hosted by UniMelb Infrastructure Engineering

Picture page 3 upper left: Kororoit Institute's foundational connections with Engineering alongside diverse further connections with academic Urban Planning.

Montage page 3 lower left: Set of pictures show building and rooms where we meet, including one from preview run of this presentation five weeks ago.

We have a rich legacy of presentations relating to transport infrastructure, two of the more recent in particular providing extended context for the positions we advocate here:

<https://www.slideshare.net/ynotds/geelong>

discusses the dampening effects of the political separation of planning for Geelong from planning for Melbourne and proposes that it might be more productive to make long term commitments to certain keystone elements to constrain and facilitate local details so that better integration is achieved long term.

<https://www.slideshare.net/ynotds/railled-decentralisation-a-proposed-rebalancing>

draws on a decade actively exploring by V/Line to understand the car-use-based divide between City and Country and coming to similar conclusion to the Rail Futures group about the potential for improving country rail services to make it more attractive to enjoy the mostly untapped capacity outside the city. Fantasies about marginally reduced car travel time from Ballarat and Geelong into the southeast via WGTP are easily dispensed in that context.

2. Complex Systems and Knowledge Management

The inescapable relevance of our stated Purposes is expanded in the second par on page 1 of our original submission.

Our pervasive Knowledge Management heritage informs us about the failures of government and the technical community activated by proponents to recognise, let alone learn, the lessons that others have taken from road megaproject responses to longstanding planning abdication.

3. Transport, Hydrology, Western Growth Areas

Some history of our work relating to transport planning is identified in the first par under "Why we care" on page 6 of our original submission, with more below.

Figure and text page 3 right: Our particular involvements with the other three impacted waterways, Stony and Moonee Ponds Creeks and the Maribyrnong, are conveniently captured by a recent catchment map used by promote Melbourne Water's Healthy Waterways Catchment Collaborations in which we are playing a significant role.

Related environmental involvements are identified in the text accompanying that map in both slide and print versions.

Our involvement with the WGT proposal has most importantly been as a networking organisation, sharing learnings from and since the community campaign against EWL with other groups. However our key concerns are over wider issues and we are particularly pleased to see and hear the City of Melbourne lay out a case we fully endorse concerning the inappropriateness of distributing more single occupant passenger vehicles into the inner city when the primary objective must be to reduce such trips and free up limited road space for more valuable uses. We particularly endorse the City's account of relevant history, both of this proposal and the state's lack of planning in the lead up, going back to Eddington.

To that point we must also note that Eddington's brief was already constrained to East-West for reasons of history that do no credit to key players. We discussed that background in greater length in our submission re EWL, the relevant part of which is included below as Appendix A. Our involvements in the broader west suggest that there are social benefits in the Maribyrnong screen line being maintained, especially to deter those of the East-Southeast seeing the West-Northwest as a dumping ground for anything they don't want closer to home.

Pages 4, 5 and top of 6:

4. Climate Change: obfuscation by vested interests

While our work on Climate Change is in its global context, it is illustrated here through tight reference to the vicinity of tidal Railway Canal cum Moonee Ponds Creek which is central to the proposed project and conflicting urban renewal plans. Well before we established Kororoit Institute, involvement with the ARC Centre of Excellence for the Mathematics and Statistics of Complex Systems (MASCOS) introduced us to Professor Ian Enting who was on secondment from CSIRO where he had been a leading contributor to the IPCC on carbon dioxide but found himself increasingly forced to defend the basic science against attack from vested interests and loose cannons. More recently, KI President Bill Hall has been drawn to the same issues by growing concern that current trajectories are accumulating a track record at the upper end of predicted scenarios coming from climate models which are gradually being revealed as a byproduct of scientific conservatism in the face of sustained political assaults. Bottom line appears to be that it will be worse, but there are still critical uncertainties which we will get back to.

Picture page 4 upper: Limit of tidal influence, Macaulay Station, RMIT UPSTREAM studio 2013

Picture page 4 lower: Archival photo of West Melbourne Lagoon unfairly characterised as a swamp by those determined to trash it to serve their industrial imperatives, then and now.

Page 5: Selected stills relating to an animated slide showing the position of relevant planning overlays and associated data (lower left) and the project's city traffic delta (lower right) against an 1860 map showing West Melbourne Lagoon (top).

Picture page 6 upper: View from Melbourne Star Observation Wheel of Railway Canal beneath City Link also included in the MPCCC presentation to the EWL Assessment Committee. The report of that committee, especially its many references to aspects that were "unacceptable" should inform this committee as there is a lot in common between the two proposals.

Pages 6 (bottom), 7 and top of 8:

5. Nepean Bay Bar: save Melbourne from rising sea

Research on the Geelong presentation mentioned above unearthed a 2011 paper by G. R. Holdgate, B. Wagstaff & S. J. Gallagher which opened up new territory for thinking about the fate of Melbourne in the face of sea level rise already locked into the climate system:

<https://www.academia.edu/1487435/>

Did Port Phillip Bay nearly dry up between 2800 and 1000 cal. yr B P. Bay-floor channelling evidence seismic and core dating

The Holdgate et al paper provides convincing evidence that Port Phillip had been sealed at Nepean Bay Bar until that seal was breached 1,000 years ago, the residual salty Lake Phillip having evaporated down to 22 metres below current sea level before the breach.

We had been aiming to present our ongoing research on the emergent possibilities late this year, but that was brought forward with release of the Draft Port Phillip Bay Environmental Management Plan 2017-2027 which was open for comment to 10 February. So we brought forward initial exposure of a far from finished version to 9 February and at the last minute received a further hurry up in the light of a January report of revised NOAA guidance, that report being via:

<http://www.climatecodered.org/2017/01/antarctic-tipping-points-for-multi.html>

It was quickly confirmed from original sources that the US National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) had released “a revised worst-case sea-level rise scenario of 2.5 metres by 2100, 5.5 metres by 2150 and 9.7 metres by 2200 (and other evidence which) strengthens an argument for considering worst-case scenarios in coastal risk management”.

The great unknown remains the exact timing and shape of the take off from the abnormal seven millennia of almost stable global sea levels towards the 20 metres widely believed to be already locked into the climate system. We can't even speculate whether that might take 300 or 3,000 years to play out, nor how the economic and ecological disruptions that will inevitably accompany it might invalidate current planning horizons. Our February presentation is at:

<https://www.slideshare.net/ynotds/nepean-bay-bar>

Right now as Kororoit Institute we would much rather be locking in the expedition to Mud Island amongst other work that is needed to put more flesh on Melbourne's most important infrastructure engineering challenge. As much as we want to be rid of the distraction of WGT, we need to also mention that it is never too early to start work on the Bellarine and Mornington Peninsula transport corridors that will be needed to service a Bay South floating port accessed from Nepean Bay Bar facing Portsea.

Picture page 6 lower: Metaphorical photograph from Indented Head of Melbourne's alternate futures.

Figure page 7 upper: Key chart from Holdgate et al 2011 with indicative orientation for reinstated barrier,

Figure page 7 lower: Context of necessary high capacity rail and road corridors needed to service Bay South port before demand exceeds the capacity of locks to provide access to the current port.

Picture page 8 upper: The Zuiderzee project in The Netherlands was around twice the size of what is envisaged here, but did not have a comparable need for rail along the main barrier, shown here via Wikipedia Commons.

The Rest of the World (section contents)

- The Environment can't see project boundaries
- Container growth projections falling off curve
- Sea level is question of when, not of whether
- Agglomeration benefits depend on rail growth
- Jane Jacobs "Saving the City" committee role

Picture page 8 lower: Llandudno, Cape Province, South Africa, 26 February 2007, last day of visit around Stellenbosch workshop on Philosophy of Complexity

6. The Environment can't see project boundaries

Picture page 9 upper: Historic Old Geelong Road Bridge in vicinity of western end of WGT project boundary during visit by IAC and submitters hosted by WDA.

We note that a new section of Kororoit Creek Trail between Grieve Parade and Barnes Road was officially opened on National Tree Day, just two days before that visit, a parting gift from Toyota to the local community. The WGTP proposes only a comparatively minuscule upgrade of "the Kororoit Creek trail between Geelong Road and Grieve Parade". (EES Volume 2, Section 11.1) That short link would likely be delivered a lot sooner without WGTP.

We also note here how we believe "environmental" should be interpreted with respect to its use in an EES in 2017. While its traditional interpretation is appropriately wide, even including social and business implications under the environmental umbrella, the natural environment has only been considered in terms of human amenity. While there is nominal compliance with legislative approaches to protecting threatened species, we believe it is important for Victoria to start to catch up with the rest of the world in recognising the legal personhood of hydrological and ecological systems. They have intrinsic values that it is no longer acceptable for humans to subjugate.

7. Container growth projections falling off curve

Picture page 9 lower: a tiny sample of the vast surplus of empty shipping containers stacked across the region, photographed at an earlier stop on the same tour. It is our impression that a classic example of how to lie with statistics underpins the container traffic forecasts on which so much port and wider traffic modelling has been based. It is likely that the data for container traffic growth from which extrapolations have been made includes a significant period in which older means of freight handling were containerised and thus cannot be taken seriously as an indicator of total freight, the growth of which is more recently tightly linked to the growth of container freight. And while the sale price of the Port of Melbourne lease may have exceeded publicly aired predictions, the conditions attached had drifted strongly the other direction from when the possibility was first raised.

Figure page 10 upper: Regional context identified in EWL EIS excludes anything like WGTP, although it too treats the vital green link provided by Moonee Ponds Creek with total disregard. This figure includes a representation of the Westlink project developed and then abandoned by the Brumby government prior to the 2010 election in favour of a West Gate Ramps proposal very similar to the West Gate Distributor taken to the 2014 election as part of Project 10,000, of which the northern portion has been completed while the delay or abandonment of the southern portion remains the Andrews Government's major broken promise. We note that some in Melbourne's West became heavily invested in the gold plated long tunnel option for Westlink and have struggled to move on. More immediately we note that the history of Westlink coupled with a look at Planning Maps

Online gives lie to assertions on behalf of the WDA with regard to Paramount Road. Proposals to improve north-south connectivity from Ashley Street via Paramount Road are at least 50 years old, with the Public Acquisition Overlay continuing beyond Geelong Road to what was for a time nominated as Docklands Highway before reverting to just being Francis Street. So it is clear that while this predated West Gate Freeway, a further extension to east-facing ramps on the freeway would be consistent with the original intent. It is also relevant that the Long Term Framework Plan for Brooklyn included in Mr O'Brien's presentation shows the area for investigation with respect to any interchange between Westlink and north-south routes as west of where the nominal Westlink route deviates south of Somerville Road after crossing the Newport-Sunshine rail line, while the Westlink route only picks up the Somerville Road alignment at Paramount Road. And Westlink was to take traffic separately into its tunnels from towards the Maribyrnong River ends of both Dynon and Footscray Roads.

Static representation of animated slide, page 10 lower, identifies a key lever by which the world turned in the mid naughties, a change which counsel for WDA don't want to know about. This animation was developed for other purposes and has been reused several times as the underlying message of the inversion of the car and oil-centric view of market capitalisation became even clearer. In 2017 it is clear that it is not just the iPhone but also Facebook and Amazon whose uptake had been amplified who have changed where future generations look for their freedom. Developing this further is out of scope here, but accepting the basic fact is critical to interpreting the inescapable data on peak car. The IAC will not be forgiven if it provides comfort for those desperate to extend the scope of capture by last century's polluting business models.

8. Sea level is question of when, not of whether

Figure page 11 upper: Chart derived from one in decade earlier Holdgate et al paper as part of aforementioned Nepean Bay Bar presentation which makes it clear that changing rather than stable sea levels are the long term norm, at least within the Pleistocene configuration of continents with its big and intermediate scale glacial oscillations. Near term rates of change in sea level will start out less than typical but continue to accelerate.

9. Agglomeration benefits depend on rail growth

Picture page 11 lower: One of Melbourne's first of the now rapidly growing trend of co-working spaces, this located on Bourke Street close to Southern Cross Station. Such places host individuals and small businesses which are big beneficiaries of the kind of agglomeration that inner cities with good public transport access provide. Controlled access roads into inner city areas have a track record of destroying potential co-working venues.

10. Jane Jacobs "Saving the City" committee role

Figure page 12 upper: Robert Moses's plan for a freeway across Lower Manhattan which Jane Jacobs contended would have done excessive damage to the fabric of the city. But it wasn't Jacobs nor Moses who decided whether the project should go ahead, it was a duly authorised committee after hearing the arguments. While the IAC can only make recommendations to the Minister for Planning, this is the moment in Melbourne's history when that recommendation should be unapologetic that nothing like the WGT proposal should be built, nor any other new roads taking single occupant passenger vehicles into inner Melbourne. The City of Melbourne's and other state policies already have such journeys on a slight downward trend through a period of rapid suburban population growth and the continuation of that trend is essential to continue to free up finite inner city road space for higher priority uses, starting with delivery vehicles.

Melbourne's population is now well past 4 million and our current still short planning horizon is looking at rapid growth to 8 million, propelling a badly unprepared planning regime into uncharted territory with immediate decision made as to what kind of city we want to become. The IAC must reject WDA's argument that the growth in radial trips can be shared across modes and accept that the mode underpinning Transurban's business model must instead be actively reduced.

Transurban has to go (section contents)

- Abandoned environmental and social duties
- Capital works exchanged for deed extensions
- Tulla widening issues, yet to assess performance
- Role of rent seeker in "city shaping" planning?
- Even Jeff Kennett says it's time for them to go

Picture page 12 lower: City Link tollway overshadowing Railway Canal, aka Moonee Ponds Creek, in the area WGTP is targeting for additional overshadowing structures.

11. Abandoned environmental and social duties

Page 13: Front page of the Autumn 2011 edition of Ponderings, the lead story of which is picked out on the corresponding slide. Through 2012, CityLink had been a good corporate citizen working supportively and actively with Moonee Ponds Creek Coordination Committee on environmental projects such as Clean Up Australia Day in the immediate vicinity of Flemington Housing Estate where these projects also had high social value. But then their management and priorities changed and they ceased to show any interest in the well being of their neighbourhood.

12. Capital works exchanged for deed extensions

Text page 14 upper: Quote from early article recommending termination of CityLink arrangements and consequent questions over the history of capital works and contract extensions. Full article is online at:

<http://www.theage.com.au/news/Kenneth-Davidson/Tollway-buyback-would-save-money-and-ease-traffic/2005/02/02/1107228766073.html>

13. Tulla widening issues, yet to assess performance

Automated switching between images is used to present these sad stories in a reduced time, with those images included in the printed version at reduced size.

Map page 14 lower: Strathmore Bypass was originally proposed to extend Bell Street to the then Lancefield Road on the southern boundary of Essendon Airport. This all became integrated into the Tullamarine Freeway with the proactive Strathmore community forcing a few changes to plans over the years. Personal experience as a child living in a house that would be demolished for the freeway and attending Strathmore High School from when it opened with the meandering Moonee Ponds Creek as our playground.

Having long avoided the blind merge for the lane heading from Bell Street to Pascoe Vale Road with traffic exiting the Freeway there, shot three minutes of video from each of below and above the merge on 16 October 2014, not finding time to edit and put online until a few days after the election. It is at:

<https://vimeo.com/113825433>

Had a long one-on-one discussion with a senior engineer at a Tulla Widening information session at Spring Street Reserve, Tullamarine, on 1 August 2015 at which he insisted that

detailed planning for that merge lane was yet to be done. It did change but came back even worse, eventually precipitating the Bridge Too Close campaign by the now Strathmore Secondary College.

But it wasn't until just after Bridge Too Close opened to traffic and it was time to shoot some complementary video that it suddenly dawned that very little traffic actually uses Bell Street to Pascoe Vale Road, a fact which wasn't surprising on reflection. Selecting the series of images for this section of our presentation, there was one shot on the same day as the original merge video that covered the relevant lanes and that made that lack of demand clear, as did doing a traffic count on that video. It isn't hard to draw the conclusion that Transurban had not even considered that possibility, but if they had half a clue about road design, they surely would have. An all too relevant extract from Kororoit Institute's Submission to the EWL EIS Assessment Committee is provided in Appendix B.

Picture series page 15 presented left column top to bottom then right with associated captions: Before and after views of Bell Street interchange, three before, one during and two after Tulla Widening.

Picture series pages 16-17: The unsuccessful community campaign to save the 130+ year old Lemon-scented Gum at Flemington Bridge. People at VicRoads have since confirmed that it was a potentially easy public relations win that was missed. It appears contract adherence was given absolute priority over common sense. As with the idea of running EWL Part B east of City Link, plans drawn up by professionals in support of the community were dismissed without any attempt to work together towards a better solution. So within the widened holding bay of Flemington Road, cyclists now have to take their chances against merging motorists making last minute decisions that they need to be in a different lane without the previous protection of a very solid tree to ride beside. While other levels at VicRoads were already taking steps to learn from their mistakes, there is not the slightest evidence that TransUrban nor CPB Contractors learnt anything, so neither should ever again be trusted with environmental responsibilities. Yet now without CityLink-Tulla Widening even being finished, let alone assessed, you are being asked to tick off a much bigger project driven by the same parties.

Picture page 18 upper: barely perceptible evidence of planting, not trees, on section of City of Moonee Valley's Ormond Park long cut off from body of park by then Tullamarine Freeway.

Total lack of environmental and community awareness makes this too frustrating to address verbally during presentation, so will list a few points and a couple of postscripts so the IAC can see how badly anything Transurban touches fails environmental and social expectations.

- Environmental organisations try to welcome all the help we can get
- Landcare are a very important player but not so much in urban areas
- Transurban has statutory offset obligations over CityLink widening
- City of Moonee Valley Master Plan adopted by Moreland and Melbourne
- Suggests lowering creekside land to add in-stream floodwater storage
- Transurban engages Landcare to deliver with token creekside plantings
- Take it or leave it for Friends to have any say in what gets planted
- Simultaneous plantings Moonee Valley and Moreland sides 1.5 km apart
- Timed so one photographer could do both, spreading Friends thin
- Letter dropping to local residents banned so no extras participate
- Moonee Valley site could have been candidate for in-stream storage
- But Transurban had their own timetable and forced it onto others

Presentation of Transurban's "Results for FY17" dated 8 August 2017 has 2 slides on Melbourne Network and 2 more on West Gate Tunnel Project.

Its final 2 points under "CityLink Tulla Widening" subhead:

- Over 80,000 trees planted to date
- New community grants program and Landcare partnership launched

"Recently added CityLink Tulla Widening Sustainability Grants Program is running on an impossible schedule for voluntary environment groups."

<http://citylinktullawidening.vic.gov.au/community/sustainability/citylink-tulla-widening-sustainability-grants-program>

14. Role of rent seeker in "city shaping" planning?

Archived poster page 18 lower: Circa 1888 advertising for Cotham Road Estate, Camberwell

<http://trove.nla.gov.au/version/186821903>

Story identified via Outer Circle Line movie:

<http://outercircleline.com.au/index.html>

Toll road operators may be late to join a much longer game of using political influence to gain financial advantage via planning decisions. This is just one of many examples that could have been chosen in this city alone to emphasise why the origins of the WGT proposal are enough reason on their own to reject it.

15. Even Jeff Kennett says it's time for them to go

Text page 19 upper: Quotes from:

<http://www.theage.com.au/victoria/transurban-the-making-of-a-monster-20160512-gotjm9.html>

There is little doubt from recent encounters with Transurban people that they have entrenched a culture in which the only thing that matters is their own financial performance.

A Fundamental Alternative (section contents)

- Passenger growth into inner city 100% by train
- Free precious inner road space for priority users
- Rail core ~20% of radial extent, role of trams
- Metro 2 rail tunnels Newport–Fishermans Bend
- Focus new roads on Interface Councils' deficit

Picture page 19 lower: single track section of Hurstbridge line adjacent to boom gate crossing at Allendale Road at the boundary of Eltham, Eltham North and Diamond Creek, serving as a placeholder for presentation video of train crossing at same location intended to ensure the presenter is still awake. That video is online at:

<https://vimeo.com/77313920>

Picture is part of collection from an investigatory visit to areas targeted by North East Link Corridor C well before it was called that.

16. Passenger growth into inner city 100% by train

Figure page 20 upper: Decade out of date data via Mr Morris plus our commentary.

Nobody has trip data broken down in a way that would enable sensible analysis and likely won't until anonymous mass collection of personal travel data becomes normalised. Even

the definition of “inner city” is used and confused disingenuously by vested interests, deliberately restricting it to even the half square mile Hoddle Grid when it suits their purposes rather than recognising that it is a growing beast.

The rule of thumb we advocate is for cities growing beyond 4 million and based on a wide reading of many factors and comparators without pretending to be something that could or should be formalised. It needs to be applied with a deep view of local history and a deeper view of potential futures. The need to reduce car trips to the inner city is also supported by submissions to a recent Senate Inquiry, points of which are quoted in Appendix C.

17. Free precious inner road space for priority users

Montage page 20 lower: Users of road space around Melbourne’s most contested intersections.

The last thing any aspirational city needs is attractors for more single occupant passenger vehicles to add to congestion and impede the flow of more valuable traffic in inner areas. The foregone civic and real estate value of on and off road space reserved for parking such vehicles has become a major deterrent which can only get stronger. Transurban’s business model and the rationale for most elements of WGTP require this to magically change. It won’t.

18. Rail core ~20% of radial extent, role of trams

Figure page 21 upper: Schematics of six Eurasian metropolitan heavy rail networks, translated by Wired magazine into American “subways” and used in our presentations since 2012 to emphasise the lack of interconnectedness of Melbourne’s spoke-hub heavy rail network topology in contrast even to Sydney where there are choices of routes with different intermediate destinations for passengers from Hornsby, Blacktown and Campbelltown lines.

Picture page 21 lower: The world’s busiest tram corridor in the world’s biggest street car network which provides at least a partial counterpoint to the disconnectedness of our rail lines.

With respect to WGTP the most important point to make is that Melbourne’s West needs priority to be given to a greatly expanded tram network, at least on a par with that long established in the east and north, and this demands tram lines not be precluded from either Dynon or Footscray Roads. Demographics and current public transport usage suggest tram utilisation will be even higher in the west as soon as a useful network can be provided.

Schematic page 22 upper: Decade old scan from printed copy of *The Age* which indicates that the only alternative to West Gate Bridge capable of providing comparable transport capacity was in rail planners’ bottom draw well before statistics would make it clear that we had passed peak car.

Figure page 22 lower: Indicative location of surface easement which can accommodate a critical section of Metro 2 before it dives beneath the lower Yarra to a major junction station below Newport, connecting several lines.

Likely demand for rail freight and passenger traffic along this alignment suggests that, like City Loop, this should be planned from the outset to provide four lines. Unlike WGTP, this truly would be city shaping. Those tunnel boring machines can still find good uses.

20. Focus new roads on Interface Councils' deficit

Picture page 23 upper: The state of Westwood Drive, part of the Palmers Road arterial corridor adjacent to Carolyn Springs, during the lead up to the 2014 election which we don't believe has changed significantly since.

Being particularly concerned with development of services for Melbourne's western Growth Areas, Kororoit Institute is well informed about the massive deficit in road infrastructure in Interface Councils' rapidly urbanising areas, from the systemic failure to provide legible north-south routing through a one mile Hoddle Grid, potentially as extensive as the equivalent in the east and north, to the lack of priority to potential quick wins at critical choke points. We are disappointed that the Treasurer's pet piecemeal upgrade of sections of the grid network close to his electorate does little for the wider utility and legibility of the network. So there is no shortage of work for road builders, just a shortage of will to develop a real understanding of the needs and potential.

Wrong Way Go Back (section contents)

- Take home message from East West Link battle
- The only major policy Labor has retreated from
- Information sessions were never consultation
- Jobs crunch, managing ramp, Sydney madness
- Use rail disruption as opportunity for rethinking

Theme page 23 lower: Revived from presentation to EWL EIS Assessment Committee because the basic point still needs to be taken on board about retracing decision making from stuck points rather than pushing through on fanciful political timing imperatives.

We further note here that both WDA and VicRoads have been strident in their rejection of anything local authorities nominate as potential improvements, suggesting to us that the WGT proposal is too fragile to be considered truly useful. Would it be more useful categorised as mini-mega? As others have pointed out, any notion of it providing insurance against closure of West Gate Bridge is fanciful.

While there has been need for both proposals to admit their misrepresentation of the history that led to and recommendations of the Eddington Report, the WGT proposal must also be condemned for its unsafe reliance on an unsolicited offer from a compromised party with no transport planning credentials.

21. Take home message from East West Link battle

Figures page 24 upper: Tunnel Vision documentary provides a powerful record of the community battle against EWL and has won numerous awards from film festival screenings but needs to find further funding to cover media rights from some historic and commercial footage included before it can gain general release.

While Tunnel Vision is appropriately focused on the pickets, the broader community also made a concerted effort to consolidate and share lots of lessons learnt during the struggle, especially with regard to infrastructure project processes and associated politics.

Picture page 24 lower: The late Julianne Bell, long term secretary of Protectors of Public Lands, with her frequent ally Rod Quantock. As mentioned at the WTGP Directions Hearing, the EWL EIS Assessment Committee tasked PPL's legal representatives, including counsel Tom Pikusa, with co-ordinating the community groups presenting at the hearings with no consideration ever given to the costs thus incurred.

22. The only major policy Labor has retreated from

Picture page 25 upper: A strong representation of the community groups involved in the coalition opposing EWL giving a token of their thanks and plaudits to Planning Minister Richard Wynne on the occasion of the official cancellation of EWL.

While we appreciate that Melbourne Water and VicRoads have seen fit to present evidence to the public assessment process this time around, there are many other government agencies and licensees conspicuous by their absence and thus leaving many questions unasked, let alone unanswered.

Kororoit Institute understands and supports the need for the IAC to make detailed recommendations about areas in which the proposal could be improved in the light of evidence from various parties, including adjustments to the associated instruments.

However we also urge you to make a much stronger first recommendation that the project not proceed and that no other projects drawing single occupant passenger vehicles into the inner city should ever again be approved.

Such recommendations would draw appropriately on the City of Melbourne's policies and actions and their reading of the state government's policies and actions beyond this proposal. In particular the proponent's suggestion that this proposal needs to be considered in combination with approved and potential public transport projects to assess compliance with the Transport Integration Act 2010 should be rejected outright. Without further repeating the specifics of point 10, above, Melbourne needs the IAC to accept that this proposal is their date with destiny and seize the moment. And while we understand the need to respond within the imposed timetable, we trust that the IAC will ensure that any recommendation of the moment of the EWL recommendation to consider moving Part B to east of City Link will not become obscured in drafting the way that one was shown to be in the appendices to our original submission.

23. Information sessions were never consultation

The history of our engagement with the proposal and its shifting proponents over the past two years is discussed in our original Submission, both in the first full paragraph on page 2 and in both paragraphs on page 5, so we won't repeat it here.

Picture page 26 lower: Telephoto-foreshortened tunnel is an icon of multi-generation failure of heavy rail planning and development necessary to serve the rapidly growing and changing needs of a new millennium.

24. Jobs crunch, managing ramp, Sydney madness

Figure page 27 upper: First saw either this or another graph of similar project accumulation bubbles at Transport Australia seminar late in 2016 presented by the person responsible for co-ordinating labor supply and demand. This version more recently (re)discovered on the internet.

At the Geelong drop in Paul Smith expressed an opinion that his responsibilities were as much about creating (construction) jobs as creating (beneficial) infrastructure. While this may be in the spirit of the government's Project 10,000 policy, it needs to be considered in the light of those bubbles and competing work that is being committed in other places. Is too much being made of rumours about passing peak housing when other indicators suggest that market is no closer to meeting underlying needs, to say nothing of the ever more urgent need to catch up on local infrastructure for exploding communities? Given the seeming urgency of state government ads for infrastructure jobs already, would it be wise for the IAC not to concern itself with the potential time and cost blowouts which could

amplify the environmental costs, especially during construction, and delay benefits long enough to undermine benefit:cost claims?

Picture page 28 upper: Saturday morning Rozelle Against WestCONnex (RAW) information stall outside craft market at Rozelle Public School.

After packing up, RAW provided a guided tour of current WestCONnex destruction. They recently produced *BOTTLENECK!* with a 60,000 print run. While there have been other contacts between the Melbourne and Sydney communities, as well as with Fremantle over the since abandoned Roe 8, the national and international dimensions of these environmentally disastrous pushes for inner urban road infrastructure needs to be fully accounted.

Montage page 28 lower: Anzac Bridge towers viewed from Rozelle and Saturday afternoon traffic on Victoria Road in the direction of that bridge.

Figure page 29 upper: Proposed Rozelle Interchange is the centrepiece of WestCONnex stage 3 which is well into its 60 day EES response window.

(Hand up copies of *BOTTLENECK!* with apologies for their unsuitability for 2 hole punching.)

Picture page 29 lower: Returning to another view of affected areas of Melbourne for potentially the final nail in the coffin.

25. Use rail disruption as opportunity for rethinking

Picture page 30 upper: All dressed up with nowhere to go, we stand around on “live” tarmac outside V/Line’s F-Gate offices where we would have once been floating on the West Melbourne Lagoon, taking in the absurdity of it all.

Figure page 30 lower: Sheet 24 of Construction Plans shows the proponent’s keenness to absorb all the facilities at E-Gate and F-Gate into the project boundary, obliterating them for the construction period and leaving their tangled delta of distributaries to frustrate future occupants.

Montage page 31 upper: The V/Line office right on the route of the Dynon Road distributary and the view from the other side pointed out by WDA representative on a Healthy Waterways Creek Collaboration visit a few days earlier.

Picture page 32 upper: On that Creek Collaboration visit, where the new Dynon Road west to Wurundjeri Way extension is planned to add yet another creek crossing, and in the light of a video of a black swan gardening which had just gone viral, spotted this pair doing their own gardening along the bank in background, at least until they spotted the photographer and decided to check whether he brought bribes, failing which they soon returned to their gardening. One version of viral video:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OWJSOQV_azU

Picture page 32 lower: Serious silos next to the rail line south of Sunshine Station viewed from across Parsons Reserve.

The bigger concluding message to the proponent’s legal team is that induced traffic is real and the most consequential environmental effect as it amplifies all others. Pretending it isn’t real is on a par with denial of anthropogenic climate change. Melbourne and the world must seize moments like this to aid the generational change in the notion of freedom in the opposite direction to that demanded by yet another new Meetup group proposed at the weekend:

Sane Roads Political Group

The roads are one of the most used, interactive and necessary parts of our life. In the forever increasing political and police control of our lives, we are constantly impeded in simply living our lives by over-zealous, fine revenue addicted governments and puppet politicians who do nothing but cater for interests that are not our own. There is a speed reduction cancer that is now eating up our time,...

Instead of such suicidal fantasies, we need to accept that a measure of traffic congestion is also a measure of the success of a city and be willing to slow down accordingly, not just on the roads but also in our road planning and construction panic. Yes, there is an infrastructure backlog, but the roads part is mostly within the Interface Councils.

Kororoit Institute's presenter has cryptically recorded impressions of those hearing days he has attended amongst near as many other recent items on his Facebook timeline:
<https://www.facebook.com/ynotds>

Appendix A: From our EWL Submission

References are frequently made to the Metropolitan Transportation Committee's 1969 plan prepared in the midst of a flurry of freeway construction, but which also needs to be seen in the context of Victoria's world leading 1970 Environment Protection Act. While our submission does not directly concern itself with environmental issues, it is important to note that the EPA led to a different understanding of the role of waterways and flood plains which conflicted with how Gardiners, Moonee Ponds and Koonung Creeks had been contained to facilitate those early freeways.

In March 1973 Premier Rupert Hamer announced the cancellation of 150 miles of freeway from the Metropolitan Transportation Committee's proposed 307 miles (including) the cancellation of the F19 west of Hoddle Street.

Source: Lay, Max; *Melbourne Miles: The Story of Melbourne's Roads*; 2003; p.209 via: <http://mrv.ozroads.net.au/SRNS/M%20Routes/M3%20Eastern/history.htm>

There it mostly rested until, in what would later be revealed as the time of peak car, "in May (2005) the Committee for Melbourne business lobby group (...) called for a tunnel linking the Eastern Freeway with the Tullamarine Freeway" which consultants commissioned by the City of Melbourne blew up into "the East-West Integrated Transport Proposal," a "road and rail tunnel linking Doncaster in the east with Deer Park in the west" Source: Silkstone, Dan; "\$10bn tunnel plan to beat city gridlock" in *The Age*, August 31, 2005 retrieved from:

<http://www.theage.com.au/articles/2005/08/30/1125302570130.html>

This part of our response is primarily concerned with how decision steps have been constrained so as to force unsatisfactory outcomes, but in light of above it is hardly surprising that the more recognised starting point of the 2008 Eddington Report was itself constrained to investigating the East-West corridor, in advance of decisions that would confine the growth of metropolitan Melbourne to a broad arc in the North and West and an isolated patch in the far Southeast.

The 1969 plan had only extended the then F19 to City Link in West Melbourne via a route that appears to even dive between the main University of Melbourne Campus and the then Melbourne (Primary) Teachers College, with many then imminent changes quickly rendering such a route unthinkable. Routes to further west only connected with the then F14 at far distant locations. So it was again unsurprising that the Eddington Report may have provided a poorly thought through indicative route for an East West road link which it concurrently condemned with a 1:0.50 cost:benefit ratio, that full East West component being quickly eliminated politically and all visible planning attention moved to the accompanying Metro Rail Tunnel and the western half of the road as a glorified next step beyond the then widely accepted as ready to proceed Maribyrnong Truck Action Group plan.

Appendix B: From our EWL Submission:

1.2 Mathematical limits

All else being equal, the rate of tarmac growth to service road traffic is exponentially faster than the rate of growth of vehicle numbers because the average length of trips grows, more so for trips via central areas. So all planning needs to focus on reducing reasons to make vehicular trips within the core of growing cities. Providing additional through routes has the opposite effect.

In addition, Braess's Paradox is a mathematical analysis backed up by numerous practical examples which show that seemingly obvious additional in-network connections can have an overall negative effect on the performance of a network such as roads in which agents (drivers) make independent choices as to their own best routes, the sum of which is deleterious. Overall flow can often be improved by deleting rather than adding choice. Refer, e.g.: Braess paradox. B.D. Calvert (originator), Encyclopedia of Mathematics. URL: http://www.encyclopediaofmath.org/index.php?title=Braess_paradox&oldid=16356

Appendix C: Need to reduce cars in inner city

By 2020

- 90 per cent of all commuter trips to the CBD will be by public transport, cycling or walking – the 2006 journey to work census figure was 72 per cent.

By 2030

- 80 per cent of all trips to the City of Melbourne will be by public transport, cycling or walking – the latest Victorian Integrated Survey of Travel and Activity (VISTA) 2009 figure is 50.9 per cent.
- 95 per cent of all trips within the municipality will be by public transport cycling and walking – the latest VISTA 2009 figure is 84 per cent.

City of Melbourne Transport Strategy (City of Melbourne 2012, p.114)

For Melbourne to continue to be a globally connected and competitive city with strong and healthy communities and higher social and economic participation, the share of trips by public transport, as well as active transport modes such as walking and cycling, must increase.

Plan Melbourne – Metropolitan Planning Strategy (DELWP 2017, p.62)

via Public Transport Users Association July 2017 Submission to the Senate Inquiry into the Operations of Existing and Proposed Toll Roads in Australia